
Investigation Into Vehicle Lift Faults Within DVA MOT Test Centres

DVA Action Plan – Progress Report at 31 May 2021



Summary of Progress at 31 May 2021

Lift Replacement (4 of 5 actions complete/ substantially complete)

- All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue have been taken out of service and a replacement programme has been completed with new lifts installed in all test centres including Belfast and Newtownards, which were used by the HSC Trusts for COVID-19 testing for a period of time and outside of DVA's control.
- The requirement for an annual condition survey has been added to MAHA contract with effect from 1 April 2020 and the outcome will be verified by an independent engineer.
- An initial process for calculating life expectancy based on number of operating cycles has been agreed but will need further refinement once DVA start operating it. Once finalised and implemented, this process will inform future replacement programmes. Installation of the software and display unit to monitor usage of lifts was completed in January 2021. An enhanced inspection and monitoring process has been developed and will be added to maintenance regimes.
- The information gathered from the cycle counters will be used to determine the life expectancy of each lift based on its unique usage. DVA anticipates that initial results, a process reflecting these, plus accompanying documentation will be ready for September and expects to complete this recommendation by 30 September 2021.
- The Worldwide equipment has arrived and the pilot test lane has been assembled at Corporation Street, Belfast. Equipment and associated ICT hardware and software performance testing has commenced and was initially scheduled to be completed by 10 May 2022. This completion date has been brought forward slightly to 31 March 2022 to align the equipment project with the Infrastructure project which will deliver a new test centre at Hydebank in autumn 2022.

Contract Management (all actions complete)

- Maintenance procedures have been confirmed and agreed with MAHA and amendments implemented with effect from 1 April 2020.
- The Terms of Reference for the 2021 annual Condition Survey were issued to MaHa on 29 March 2021.
- The new contract for Independent Inspections details the requirement for thorough examinations to be completed and also provides for ad-hoc equipment surveys to be conducted.
- In line with a recommendation by Internal Audit, desk-top procedures have been developed for reporting arrangements and were issued to relevant business areas on

25 May 2021.

- Independent inspections will provide categorisation of faults in line with legislative standards and will provide indication of severity, impact and timescale for repair.
- An additional clause has been included to strengthen the protection of DVA from additional expense should a major disruption to service ever occur again.
- The liability value within the MAHA contract has been reviewed by DVA. Taking into consideration all aspects of the contract and measures introduced to strengthen controls the liability value is considered to be appropriate.

Inspection / Maintenance (all actions complete)

- A contract for Independent Insurance inspections was awarded on 1 May 2020. As a result of the new contract, DVA will take ownership of the reports from the independent engineering insurance inspectors.
- In line with a recommendation by Internal Audit, desk-top procedures have been developed for reporting arrangements and were issued to relevant business areas on 25 May 2021.
- Amendments to routine maintenance procedures have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020.
- DVA has considered the feasibility of adding cycle counters to lifts and a process for calculating life expectancy based on number of operating cycles is currently being progressed.

Governance (all actions complete)

- Internal processes/responsibilities have been established across various sections within the Agency, including Contract Management, Health & Safety and Operations.
- In line with a recommendation by Internal Audit, desk-top procedures have been developed and were issued to relevant business areas on 25 May 2021.
- DVA Business Continuity Plans have been reviewed and revised to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.

Monitoring Processes (2 of 4 actions complete)

- This document forms part of the DVA's commitment to report progress in implementing the Action Plan.
- Quarterly Progress Report at 28 February 2021 presented to the Permanent Secretary, the Minister, DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee and published on the Department's website.

- Follow up and validation of actions completed in this Action Plan have been included in the DVA Internal Audit Plan for 2020-21.
- Internal Audit completed their review of the Action Plan and reported their findings to the Permanent Secretary on 5 March 2021.
- Internal Audit have completed a follow up review of their initial findings and recommendations on the Action Plan and reported their findings to the Permanent Secretary on 22 July 2021.

Internal Audit Follow-up review of Action Plan

The purpose of this review was to confirm progress against the Action Plan relating to the following report:

- Investigation into Vehicle Lift Faults within MOT Centres, report dated 3 March 2020.

The review did not include a follow-up on the actions included within the Action Plan relating to the WYG Engineering Ltd report.

Internal Audit validated the progress reported against the 17 actions detailed within the Action Plan dated 30 November 2020. They found that 12 actions have been fully completed. They evaluated four actions as substantially completed, however, they were content that significant aspects of these have been addressed. Determining the criteria for assessment of the life expectancy of the lifts is a complex issue and Internal Audit acknowledged that further work is required to refine this formula further. Internal Audit found that the processes for Independent Inspections have recently been clarified with the Inspector and that an internal process flowchart has been documented. Internal Audit have recommended that these processes are developed further into detailed procedures and DVA management agreed these desk-top procedures would be completed by 31 May 2021. This has now been completed and desk-top procedures were issued to the relevant business areas on 25 May 2021.

One action relating to the Terms of Reference for the annual Condition Survey could not be tested as management had not had the opportunity to complete it. This action has now been completed and the Terms of Reference for the 2021 annual Condition Survey were issued to MaHa on 29 March 2021.

A subsequent follow-up review by Internal Audit of the outstanding actions and recommendations within their Investigation report was carried out and reported to the Permanent Secretary on 22 July 2021.

A summary of Internal Audit's evaluation is included against the relevant actions in the Action Plan below and confirms 16 of the 17 actions have now been fully completed. The one remaining action to determine the criteria for assessment of the life expectancy of lifts is due to be completed by 30 September 2021.

DVA Action Plan – Position at 31 May 2021

ANNEX A

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
LIFT REPLACEMENT						
1. All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue to be taken out of service.	WYG para 6.0	All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue shall be taken out of service.	27 January 2020	COMPLETE	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive
2. All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue to be replaced.	WYG para 6.0	Replace all lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue.	31 July 2020	COMPLETE New lifts installed at all test centres including Belfast and Newtownards which were previously being used by the HSC Trusts for COVID-19 testing and outside of DVA's control.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
3. Life expectancy of lifts had not been pre-determined. This potentially impacted on timing of lift replacement programme	GIAFIS para 3.12 WYG para 7.0	Agree projected life expectancy for new lifts with MAHA to inform timescale for any lift replacements. Agree plan to roll-out cycle counter monitoring software	31 July 2020 revised to 30 September 2020 Revised to 30 September 2021	COMPLETE MAHA has provided an initial estimate of product life expectancy of four years for new lifts based on anticipated load cycles through normal use at DVA centres. MAHA has confirmed the availability of software to monitor usage of lifts. The installation of software and display unit was completed in Jan 2021. An inspection and	SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
		<p>Agree the criteria for assessing the life expectancy of lifts</p>		<p>monitoring process has been developed which will be added to current maintenance regimes.</p> <p>An initial process for calculating life expectancy based on number of operating cycles has been agreed but will need further refinement once we start operating it, possibly requiring a two month period to get a suitable range of data. Once finalised and implemented, this process will inform future replacement programmes.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that these actions have been substantially completed.</p> <p>We acknowledge that DVA will perform further work to refine the data which will be collected from the test centres.</p>		

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p><u>DVA UPDATE</u> The information gathered from the cycle counters will be used to determine the life expectancy of each lift based on its unique usage. DVA anticipates that initial results, a process reflecting these, plus accompanying documentation will be ready for September 2021 and expects to complete this recommendation by 30 September 2021.</p> <p><u>FOLLOW UP INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that these actions have been substantially completed.</p> <p>Progress remains ongoing to collect data from the cycle counter monitoring software and to refine the formula for projected life expectancy of the lifts.</p>		
4. No lift replacement plan in place.	GIAFIS para 3.12	Perform an annual condition survey at appropriate point, verified by independent engineer.	01 April 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
		A replacement schedule of relevant equipment will be developed on the basis of the condition report.		<p>Requirement for annual condition survey added to MAHA contract with effect from 1 April 2020.</p> <p>The outcome of the annual condition survey will be verified by the independent engineer contract.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that these actions have been fully completed.</p>		
5. Future lift specification and design to be agreed with new equipment provider.		Agree design and specification for new lifts with WEP and conduct performance testing.	<p>31 December 2020 revised to 31 March 2021</p> <p>Revised to 31 March 2022</p>	<p>The design and specification of the lift has been agreed.</p> <p>The Worldwide equipment has arrived and the pilot test lane has been assembled at Corporation Street, Belfast. Performance testing has commenced and was initially scheduled to be completed by 10 May 2022.</p> <p>This completion date has been brought forward slightly</p>	PARTIALLY COMPLETE	SRO for Equipment Project

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				to 31 March 2022 to align the equipment project with the Infrastructure project which will deliver a new test centre at Hydebank in autumn 2022.		
CONTRACT MANAGEMENT						
<p>1. DVA did not specify the detailed terms of reference for the condition survey report.</p> <p>Consequently, the report did not enable DVA to fully evaluate the potential outcome of future independent inspections.</p>	GIAFIS para 1.7	Ensure target dates/content and detail of reports are specified as part of the requirement for any reports/surveys commissioned in future.	Ad hoc	<p>COMPLETE</p> <p>The MAHA contract details the requirements for 8 weekly and monthly inspections to be completed and also includes option for ad hoc equipment surveys to be conducted.</p> <p>The new contract for Independent Inspections details the requirement for 6 monthly thorough examinations to be completed and also provides for ad hoc equipment surveys to be conducted.</p> <p>If ad hoc surveys are requested by DVA specific terms of reference will be agreed, with the respective contractor, including target dates for completion.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>This could not yet be tested and is due to be completed by DVA during 2021.</p> <p><u>DVA UPDATE</u></p> <p>The Terms of Reference for the 2021 annual condition survey were issued to MaHa on 29 March 2021.</p> <p><u>FOLLOW UP INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>		
<p>2. Repairs had already been carried out without prior notification/approval by DVA Contract Management staff.</p> <p>Consequently, the integrity of the repair was not able to be assessed.</p>	<p>GIAFIS para 4.9</p>	<p>Ensure that reactive maintenance procedures are fully understood by the contractor, including that DVA Contract Management must approve all future equipment repairs before work is commissioned.</p>	<p>06 May 2020</p>	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Procedures confirmed and agreed with MAHA on 6 May 2020.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p>	<p>COMPLETE</p>	<p>DVA Director of Transformation</p>

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				We are content that this action has been fully completed.		
<p>3. DVA did not specify how MAHA would categorise any faults found or the role of the independent inspectors.</p> <p>Consequently, the severity or impact of the identified cracks was not fully understood.</p>	<p>GIAFIS paras 1.7 and 4.11</p>	<p>Ensure requirement for categorisation of faults is specified for all future reports/surveys commissioned.</p>	<p>30 June 2020</p>	<p>COMPLETE</p> <p>Discussions with new Independent Inspectors have confirmed that independent inspections will provide categorisation of faults in line with legislative standards and will provide indication of severity and impact. Such faults will then be reported to the contractor based on priority (as below) in line with the categorisation provided.</p> <p>Any faults identified by/to MAHA are categorised in line with KPIs relating to priorities for fault resolution as specified within the contractual Performance Standards. Each priority reflects the nature, severity and impact of the fault, and sets a timescale for resolution.</p>	<p>COMPLETE</p>	<p>DVA Director of Transformation</p>

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>		
<p>4. No timescale for repair of Category B defect was stated by the independent inspector.</p>	<p>GIAFIS para 4.7</p>	<p>Agree timescale for repairs in relation to the new contract for independent inspections</p>	<p>30 June 2020</p>	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Discussions held with new independent inspectors and processes agreed, including the need for a defined timescale for repair of each defect identified. Independent inspections will provide categorisation of faults in line with legislative standards and will provide indication of severity, impact and timescale for repair. Such faults will then be reported to the contractor based on priority (as below) in line with the categorisation provided.</p> <p>All faults identified by MAHA are categorised in line with KPIs relating to priorities for fault resolution as specified within the contractual Performance Standards. Each priority reflects the nature,</p>	<p>COMPLETE</p>	<p>DVA Director of Transformation</p>

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p>severity and impact of the fault, and sets a timescale for resolution.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been substantially completed.</p> <p>Whilst reporting arrangements have now been clarified with the Independent Inspector, we recommend that these are developed further into detailed desk-top procedures.</p> <p><u>DVA UPDATE</u> Desk-top procedures have been issued to relevant business areas on 25 May 2021</p> <p><u>FOLLOW UP INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>		

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
5. The maintenance schedule was not sufficiently detailed to uncover the issue of the cracked lifts.	WYG para 7.0	Ensure vehicle lift inspection process is supplemented with a more specific list of items to be inspected as part of the general inspection.	01 April 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020. These include additional requirements for inspection of vehicle lifts.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
6. DVA Vehicle Testing Equipment Maintenance Contract includes limited cover for contractor performance/ liability issues.		Review existing contractor performance/liability clauses within the DVA Vehicle Testing Equipment Contract to assess whether these can be strengthened.	30 June 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>An additional clause has been included in the contract to strengthen the protection of DVA from additional expense should a major disruption to service ever occur again.</p> <p>The liability value within the MAHA contract has been reviewed by DVA. Taking into consideration all aspects of the contract and measures introduced to strengthen controls the liability value is considered to be appropriate.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>		
INSPECTION / MAINTENANCE						
<p>1. Independent engineering insurance inspections were managed by MAHA through existing contract, which was perceived as a potential conflict of interest.</p>	<p>GIAFIS para 1.2</p>	<p>DVA to appoint independent engineering insurance inspectors to conduct thorough examination inspections of relevant equipment in test centres.</p>	<p>01 May 2020</p>	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Contract for Independent Insurance inspections procured and awarded on 1 May. Independent inspections removed from MAHA contract 30 April. Internal processes/ responsibilities currently being established with CMP, H&S and Operations. Discussions initiated with new contractor, including roles/responsibilities and communication protocols.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p>	COMPLETE	<p>DVA Director of Transformation</p>

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				We are content that this action has been fully completed.		
2. There were no cycle counters fitted to lifts to record number of lift cycles to inform a decision on life expectancy.	WYG para 7.0	Consider feasibility of adding cycle counters to all lifts.	30 June 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Feasibility of cycle counters has been explored with MAHA. The equipment operating software currently records operating cycles and this information can be extracted. A process for calculating life expectancy based on number of operating cycles is currently being progressed. Once developed, a means of continuous review will be implemented, and will inform future replacement programmes.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
3. Inspection process may not have been sufficiently aligned to vehicle lift usage.	WYG para 7.0	Develop revised inspection process based on the vehicle lift usage.	01 April 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020, based on manufacturer's</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				recommendation and operating instructions.		
4. Cracks were identified in lifts during a thorough examination inspection but there was no record within DVA that a Serious Defect Report was provided at the time.	GIAFIS para 4.3	All future inspection and defect reports shall be provided to DVA on completion of a thorough examination inspection to ensure repairs are carried out within recommended timescales.	01 May 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>As a result of the new contract, DVA will take ownership of the reports from the independent engineering insurance inspectors. New procedures will ensure defects are notified and repairs effected on a timely basis.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been substantially completed.</p> <p>Whilst reporting arrangements have now been clarified with the Independent Inspector, we recommended that these are developed further into detailed desk-top procedures.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p><u>DVA UPDATE</u> Desk-top procedures have been developed and were issued to relevant business areas 25 May 2021</p> <p><u>FOLLOW UP INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>		
5. WYG recommended that the general inspection of each lift should include an inspection by a Structural Engineer.	WYG para 7.0	Ensure inspection of equipment, including lifts, is completed by a suitably qualified engineer.	01 April 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020. These include additional requirements for inspection of vehicle lifts. Routine maintenance will be carried out by fully qualified MAHA engineers.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
GOVERNANCE						
1. DVA Health and Safety and Contract Management Roles and	GIAFIS paras	Clarify roles and responsibilities between DVA Health and Safety and DVA Contract Management	31 May 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
responsibilities not clearly defined.	4.10 to 4.12			<p>Internal processes/ responsibilities established with CMP, H&S and Operations. Discussions initiated with new contractor, including roles/responsibilities and communication protocols.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been substantially completed.</p> <p>Whilst a flowchart process has been documented, we recommended that further detailed desk-top procedures are developed.</p> <p><u>DVA UPDATE</u> Desk-top procedures have been developed and were issued to relevant business areas 25 May 2021</p> <p><u>FOLLOW UP INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p>		

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				We are content that this action has been fully completed.		
		Consider whether the Health and Safety team and Contract Management responsibilities should rest with a single Director or Grade 7 within DVA.	31 May 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>The H&S function will move into the Directorate responsible for Contract Management with effect from 1 June 2020.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive
2. Throughout the investigation process there were a number of instances where key discussions and key decisions were not formally documented.	GIAFIS para 1.14	Ensure proper procedures are in place to record key decisions and key meetings.	20 April 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Confirmation that arrangements are in place to properly record all key decisions and key meetings. Communication issued to all business areas.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p>	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive and All Directors

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				We are content that this action has been fully completed.		
3. Review DVA business continuity plans to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.		DVA Business Continuity Plans shall be reviewed and revised to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.	30 September 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>DVA Business Continuity Plans have been reviewed and revised to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive and All Directors
MONITORING PROCESSES						
1. Investigation report and the DVA Chief Executive's response to the Permanent Secretary's memo of 7 April be provided to the DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee		Provide copy of NICS GIAFIS Investigation report to DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee	09 April 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Chief Executive confirmed that the report was provided to Audit Committee members on 9 April and he briefed the Audit Committee Chair on same day. A copy of the memo and this response will also be copied to Audit Committee members.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>		
2. Implementing DVA Action Plan		Implementation of DVA Action plan shall be monitored by DVA Audit Committee	DVA Audit Committee Meetings	<p>February progress update reported to DVA Audit Committee on 26 April 2021.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>	Ongoing	DVA Audit Committee Chair
3. Reporting progress in implementing Action Plan		Monthly reporting of progress in implementing Action Plan to the Permanent Secretary and the Minister	05 June 2020 (and monthly thereafter)	<p>Ongoing – February progress reported to Permanent Secretary, the Minister and quarterly update published on the Departmental website. Agreement from the Minister that the next formal progress report to be provided will be at the end of May 2021.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p>	Ongoing	DVA Chief Executive

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				We are content that this action has been fully completed.		
4. DVA Internal Audit Plan for 2020-21		Validation of actions in this Action Plan will be included in DVA Internal Audit Plan for 2020-21 and reported to DVA Audit and Risk Committee.	30 June 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u> Internal Audit have revised their Audit Plan for 20-21 to include 20 days for the follow up work on the recommendations and the revised Plan came to the May ARAC. Internal Audit have completed their review of the Action Plan and reported their findings to the Permanent Secretary on 5 March 2021. Internal Audit have completed a follow up review of their initial findings and recommendations on the Action Plan and reported their findings to the Permanent Secretary on 22 July 2021.</p> <p><u>INTERNAL AUDIT EVALUATION</u></p> <p>We are content that this action has been fully completed.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive