
Investigation Into Vehicle Lift Faults Within DVA MOT Test Centres

DVA Action Plan – Progress Report at 30 November 2020



Summary of Progress at 30 November 2020

Lift Replacement (4 of 5 actions complete)

- All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue have been taken out of service and a replacement programme has been completed with new lifts installed in all test centres including Belfast and Newtownards, which were used by the HSC Trusts for COVID-19 testing for a period of time and outside of DVA's control.
- The requirement for an annual condition survey has been added to MAHA contract with effect from 1 April 2020 and the outcome will be verified by an independent engineer.
- An initial process for calculating life expectancy based on number of operating cycles has been agreed but will need further refinement once we start operating it. Once finalised and implemented, this process will inform future replacement programmes. MAHA has confirmed the software to monitor usage of lifts has been delayed due to Covid-19 related issues and is now expected to be installed by March 2021. An enhanced inspection and monitoring process has been developed and will be added to maintenance regimes.

Contract Management (all actions complete)

- Maintenance procedures have been confirmed and agreed with MAHA and amendments implemented with effect from 1 April 2020.
- The new contract for Independent Inspections details the requirement for thorough examinations to be completed and also provides for ad-hoc equipment surveys to be conducted.
- Independent inspections will provide categorisation of faults in line with legislative standards and will provide indication of severity, impact and timescale for repair.
- An additional clause has been included to strengthen the protection of DVA from additional expense should a major disruption to service ever occur again.
- The liability value within the MAHA contract has been reviewed by DVA. Taking into consideration all aspects of the contract and measures introduced to strengthen controls the liability value is considered to be appropriate.

Inspection / Maintenance (all actions complete)

- A contract for Independent Insurance inspections was awarded on 1 May 2020. As a result of the new contract, DVA will take ownership of the reports from the independent engineering insurance inspectors.
- Amendments to routine maintenance procedures have been agreed and implemented

with effect from 1 April 2020.

- DVA has considered the feasibility of adding cycle counters to lifts and a process for calculating life expectancy based on number of operating cycles is currently being progressed.

Governance (all actions complete)

- Internal processes/responsibilities have been established across various sections within the Agency, including Contract Management, Health & Safety and Operations.
- DVA Business Continuity Plans have been reviewed and revised to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.

Monitoring Processes (2 of 4 actions complete)

- This document forms part of the DVA's commitment to report progress in implementing the Action Plan.
- Quarterly Progress Report at 31 August 2020 presented to the Permanent Secretary, the Minister, DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee and published on the Department's website.
- Monthly Progress Report at 31 October 2020 presented to the Permanent Secretary, the Minister, DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee.
- Follow up and validation of actions completed in this Action Plan have been included in the DVA Internal Audit Plan for 2020-21.
- Internal Audit commenced their follow up review of the Action Plan w/c 16 November 2020.

DVA Action Plan – Position at 30 November 2020

ANNEX A

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
LIFT REPLACEMENT						
1. All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue to be taken out of service.	WYG para 6.0	All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue shall be taken out of service.	27 January 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u>	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive
2. All lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue to be replaced.	WYG para 6.0	Replace all lifts exhibiting signs of fatigue.	31 July 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> New lifts installed at all test centres including Belfast and Newtownards which were previously being used by the HSC Trusts for COVID-19 testing and outside of DVA's control.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
3. Life expectancy of lifts had not been pre-determined. This potentially impacted on timing of lift replacement programme	GIAFIS para 3.12 WYG para 7.0	Agree projected life expectancy for new lifts with MAHA to inform timescale for any lift replacements. Agree plan to roll-out cycle counter monitoring software	31 July 2020 revised to 30 September 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> MAHA has provided an initial estimate of product life expectancy of four years for new lifts based on anticipated load cycles through normal use at DVA centres. MAHA has confirmed the availability of software to monitor usage of lifts and installation of software and display unit is expected by Mar 2021. An inspection and monitoring process has been	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
		Agree the criteria for assessing the life expectancy of lifts		<p>developed which will be added to current maintenance regimes.</p> <p>An initial process for calculating life expectancy based on number of operating cycles has been agreed but will need further refinement once we start operating it, possibly requiring a two month period to get a suitable range of data. Once finalised and implemented, this process will inform future replacement programmes.</p>		
4. No lift replacement plan in place.	GIAFIS para 3.12	<p>Perform an annual condition survey at appropriate point, verified by independent engineer.</p> <p>A replacement schedule of relevant equipment will be developed on the basis of the condition report.</p>	01 April 2020	<p>COMPLETE</p> <p>Requirement for annual condition survey added to MAHA contract with effect from 1 April 2020.</p> <p>The outcome of the annual condition survey will be verified by the independent engineer contract.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
5. Future lift specification and design to be agreed with new equipment provider.		Agree design and specification for new lifts with WEP and conduct performance testing.	31 December 2020	The design and specification of the lift has been agreed. However this action	PARTIALLY COMPLETE	SRO for Equipment Project

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
			revised to 31 March 2021	completion date will not now be met due to COVID-19 restrictions as it was dependant on installation of the pilot test lane in September 2020. This test lane installation cannot take place until quarantine restrictions have been eased as the suppliers come from Spain and USA. A tentative date of 15 February 2021 has been agreed with the supplier for the installation of the pilot test lane.		
CONTRACT MANAGEMENT						
<p>1. DVA did not specify the detailed terms of reference for the condition survey report.</p> <p>Consequently, the report did not enable DVA to fully evaluate the potential outcome of future independent inspections.</p>	GIAFIS para 1.7	Ensure target dates/content and detail of reports are specified as part of the requirement for any reports/surveys commissioned in future.	Ad hoc	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>The MAHA contract details the requirements for 8 weekly and monthly inspections to be completed and also includes option for ad hoc equipment surveys to be conducted.</p> <p>The new contract for Independent Inspections details the requirement for 6 monthly thorough examinations to be completed and also provides for ad hoc</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				<p>equipment surveys to be conducted.</p> <p>If ad hoc surveys are requested by DVA specific terms of reference will be agreed, with the respective contractor, including target dates for completion.</p>		
<p>2. Repairs had already been carried out without prior notification/approval by DVA Contract Management staff.</p> <p>Consequently, the integrity of the repair was not able to be assessed.</p>	<p>GIAFIS para 4.9</p>	<p>Ensure that reactive maintenance procedures are fully understood by the contractor, including that DVA Contract Management must approve all future equipment repairs before work is commissioned.</p>	<p>06 May 2020</p>	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Procedures confirmed and agreed with MAHA on 6 May 2020.</p>	<p>COMPLETE</p>	<p>DVA Director of Transformation</p>
<p>3. DVA did not specify how MAHA would categorise any faults found or the role of the independent inspectors.</p> <p>Consequently, the severity or impact of the identified cracks was not fully understood.</p>	<p>GIAFIS paras 1.7 and 4.11</p>	<p>Ensure requirement for categorisation of faults is specified for all future reports/surveys commissioned.</p>	<p>30 June 2020</p>	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Discussions with new Independent Inspectors have confirmed that independent inspections will provide categorisation of faults in line with legislative standards and will provide indication of severity and impact. Such faults will then be reported to the contractor based on priority (as below) in line with the categorisation provided.</p>	<p>COMPLETE</p>	<p>DVA Director of Transformation</p>

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				Any faults identified by/to MAHA are categorised in line with KPIs relating to priorities for fault resolution as specified within the contractual Performance Standards. Each priority reflects the nature, severity and impact of the fault, and sets a timescale for resolution.		
4. No timescale for repair of Category B defect was stated by the independent inspector.	GIAFIS para 4.7	Agree timescale for repairs in relation to the new contract for independent inspections	30 June 2020	<p>COMPLETE</p> <p>Discussions held with new independent inspectors and processes agreed, including the need for a defined timescale for repair of each defect identified. Independent inspections will provide categorisation of faults in line with legislative standards and will provide indication of severity, impact and timescale for repair. Such faults will then be reported to the contractor based on priority (as below) in line with the categorisation provided.</p> <p>All faults identified by MAHA are categorised in line with KPIs relating to priorities for fault</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				resolution as specified within the contractual Performance Standards. Each priority reflects the nature, severity and impact of the fault, and sets a timescale for resolution.		
5. The maintenance schedule was not sufficiently detailed to uncover the issue of the cracked lifts.	WYG para 7.0	Ensure vehicle lift inspection process is supplemented with a more specific list of items to be inspected as part of the general inspection.	01 April 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020. These include additional requirements for inspection of vehicle lifts.</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
6. DVA Vehicle Testing Equipment Maintenance Contract includes limited cover for contractor performance/ liability issues.		Review existing contractor performance/liability clauses within the DVA Vehicle Testing Equipment Contract to assess whether these can be strengthened.	30 June 2020	<p><u>COMPLETE</u></p> <p>An additional clause has been included in the contract to strengthen the protection of DVA from additional expense should a major disruption to service ever occur again.</p> <p>The liability value within the MAHA contract has been reviewed by DVA. Taking into consideration all aspects of the</p>	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				contract and measures introduced to strengthen controls the liability value is considered to be appropriate.		
INSPECTION / MAINTENANCE						
1. Independent engineering insurance inspections were managed by MAHA through existing contract, which was perceived as a potential conflict of interest.	GIAFIS para 1.2	DVA to appoint independent engineering insurance inspectors to conduct thorough examination inspections of relevant equipment in test centres.	01 May 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Contract for Independent Insurance inspections procured and awarded on 1 May. Independent inspections removed from MAHA contract 30 April. Internal processes/ responsibilities currently being established with CMP, H&S and Operations. Discussions initiated with new contractor, including roles/responsibilities and communication protocols.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
2. There were no cycle counters fitted to lifts to record number of lift cycles to inform a decision on life expectancy.	WYG para 7.0	Consider feasibility of adding cycle counters to all lifts.	30 June 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Feasibility of cycle counters has been explored with MAHA. The equipment operating software currently records operating cycles and this	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				information can be extracted. A process for calculating life expectancy based on number of operating cycles is currently being progressed. Once developed, a means of continuous review will be implemented, and will inform future replacement programmes.		
3. Inspection process may not have been sufficiently aligned to vehicle lift usage.	WYG para 7.0	Develop revised inspection process based on the vehicle lift usage.	01 April 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020, based on manufacturer's recommendation and operating instructions.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
4. Cracks were identified in lifts during a thorough examination inspection but there was no record within DVA that a Serious Defect Report was provided at the time.	GIAFIS para 4.3	All future inspection and defect reports shall be provided to DVA on completion of a thorough examination inspection to ensure repairs are carried out within recommended timescales.	01 May 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> As a result of the new contract, DVA will take ownership of the reports from the independent engineering insurance inspectors. New procedures will ensure defects are notified and repairs effected on a timely basis.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
5. WYG recommended that the general inspection of each lift should include an inspection by a Structural Engineer.	WYG para 7.0	Ensure inspection of equipment, including lifts, is completed by a suitably qualified engineer.	01 April 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Amendments to routine maintenance procedures (8 weekly and 6 monthly) have been agreed and implemented with effect from 1 April 2020. These include additional requirements for inspection of vehicle lifts. Routine maintenance will be carried out by fully qualified MAHA engineers.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
GOVERNANCE						
1. DVA Health and Safety and Contract Management Roles and responsibilities not clearly defined.	GIAFIS paras 4.10 to 4.12	Clarify roles and responsibilities between DVA Health and Safety and DVA Contract Management	31 May 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Internal processes/ responsibilities established with CMP, H&S and Operations. Discussions initiated with new contractor, including roles/responsibilities and communication protocols.	COMPLETE	DVA Director of Transformation
		Consider whether the Health and Safety team and Contract Management responsibilities should rest with a single Director or Grade 7 within DVA.	31 May 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> The H&S function will move into the Directorate responsible for Contract	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
				Management with effect from 1 June 2020.		
2. Throughout the investigation process there were a number of instances where key discussions and key decisions were not formally documented.	GIAFIS para 1.14	Ensure proper procedures are in place to record key decisions and key meetings.	20 April 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Confirmation that arrangements are in place to properly record all key decisions and key meetings. Communication issued to all business areas.	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive and All Directors
3. Review DVA business continuity plans to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.		DVA Business Continuity Plans shall be reviewed and revised to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.	30 September 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> DVA Business Continuity Plans have been reviewed and revised to take account of lessons learned from lift issues.	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive and All Directors
MONITORING PROCESSES						
1. Investigation report and the DVA Chief Executive's response to the Permanent Secretary's memo of 7 April be provided to the DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee		Provide copy of NICS GIAFIS Investigation report to DVA Audit and Risk Assurance Committee	09 April 2020	<u>COMPLETE</u> Chief Executive confirmed that the report was provided to Audit Committee members on 9 April and he briefed the Audit Committee Chair on same day. A copy of the memo and this response will also be copied to Audit Committee members.	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive

Issue	Report Reference	Action	Completion Date	Update	R/A/G	Owner
2. Implementing DVA Action Plan		Implementation of DVA Action plan shall be monitored by DVA Audit Committee	DVA Audit Committee Meetings	Combined September / October progress update reported to DVA Audit Committee on 30 November.	Ongoing	DVA Audit Committee Chair
3. Reporting progress in implementing Action Plan		Monthly reporting of progress in implementing Action Plan to the Permanent Secretary and the Minister	05 June 2020 (and monthly thereafter)	Ongoing – September / October progress reported to Permanent Secretary, the Minister and quarterly update published on the Departmental website.	Ongoing	DVA Chief Executive
4. DVA Internal Audit Plan for 2020-21		Validation of actions in this Action Plan will be included in DVA Internal Audit Plan for 2020-21 and reported to DVA Audit and Risk Committee.	30 June 2020	COMPLETE Internal Audit have revised their Audit Plan for 20-21 to include 20 days for the follow up work on the recommendations and the revised Plan came to the May ARAC. Internal Audit commenced their follow up review of the Action Plan w/c 16 November 2020.	COMPLETE	DVA Chief Executive